

**POLICY EVALUATION OF HIGH-LEVEL TALENTS IN  
GUANGZHOU CITY, GUANGDONG PROVINCE,  
PEOPLE'S REPUBLIC OF CHINA**

**Qiu Haizhen<sup>1</sup>Satit Niyomyah<sup>2</sup> Kamolporn Kalyanamitra<sup>3</sup>**

**Nattawat Siriphornwut<sup>4</sup>**

Bangkokthonburi University

Thailand<sup>1-4</sup>

**Email:** kramonporn@hotmail.com<sup>1-4</sup>

**Received:** January 31, 2023; **Revised:** April 5, 2023; **Accepted:** May 8, 2023

**Abstract**

The purpose of this study was as follows: (1) In order to understand the overall evaluation of the implementation effect of Guangzhou city's high-level talent policy, made up for the deficiencies of the existing research on the performance evaluation mechanism of local urban talent policy, and provide new ideas for the research on the scientific performance evaluation system of talent policy. (2) In order to understand the effect of Guangzhou city's high-level talent policy in formulation, content and implementation, and provide improvement basis for Chinese local governments to formulate high-level talent policy more effectively. (3) To provide optimization suggestions for high-level talents of local government governance in China, and promote the sustainable growth of local government economy and science and technology.

This research was a combination of quantitative and qualitative methods. The first was to collect data. The data were from the official data such as the annual Guangdong statistical yearbook, the Guangdong science and Technology Yearbook, the Guangzhou Yearbook and the work report of the Guangzhou municipal government. There were 100 high-level talents from the survey work and living in Guangzhou city. 100 questionnaires were distributed and 94 valid questionnaires were recovered. Secondly, 10 people representing the policy makers, employers and high-level talents of Guangzhou city were interviewed.

The conclusions of this study were as follows: (1) Using the entropy method to measure the effectiveness and value of the indicators, the analysis showed that the overall implementation effect of the high-level talents policy in Guangzhou city was good, the policy had a significant positive effect on the development of high-level talents in Guangzhou city, and the future development of the talent policy was expected. Through questionnaires and interviews, we understood the current situation of Guangzhou city's high-level talent policy in terms of formulation, content and implementation effect. The analysis results showed that Guangzhou city's high-level talent policy covered a wide range of areas, and the key points were not prominent, and the effect of "human capital" had not been maximized.

**Keywords:** Guangzhou city, People's republic of China, High level talent policy, Policy evaluation, Policy performance

## Introduction

Since Theodore Schultz first put forward the concept of human capital in 1960, the economic growth models developed by Romer, Gary Baker and Lucas had demonstrated the decisive role of human capital in economic growth (Romer, 1990; Lucas, 1988), in the era of knowledge economy and information economy, talents were the key to solve the bottleneck of development and enhance international competitiveness (Michael Porter, 2002). Moreover, under the background of aging population and declining birth rate in the world, talent resources had become the common competition object of all countries in the world, and all countries had implemented talent policies to compete for talents. Under the tide of globalization, the role of talent policy was mainly reflected in weakening the market domination, which had played a strong intervention role in promoting the change of talent flow mode and the accumulation of talent resources. Relevant research showed that talent flow had changed from investment driven in the 1960s to multi environment driven, and policy driven (Comay, 1971; de Tinguy & Wenden, 1993; Sani, 2000; Djalal, 2001; Creehan, 2001; Florida, 2002; Shapiro, 2006; Buch et al, 2013; Huang Haigang, 2017). The current phenomenon of talent flow and introduction was the result of the talent attraction policies planned by developing countries to promote economic development in the past 10-20 years (Jonkers & Tijssen, 2008).

Nevertheless, there were still many deficiencies in the overall governance effectiveness of talent policy tools. Among 63 countries/regions ranked by International Institute for Management Development (IMD) world talent report 2021 released by IMD, China ranks 16th (Ranked 40th, 39th, 42nd and 20th respectively in 2017, 2018, 2019 and 2020). In 2020, all countries will face two challenges, namely, the outbreak of COVID-19 and the ensuing economic crisis. China had responded well to these two challenges. The IMD report in 2021 showed that the global competitiveness measures the long-term impact. In order to cope with the health crisis, the government efficiency could improve the competitiveness in the short term, but the improvement of an economy's long-term competitiveness still depend on innovation. Innovation was the cornerstone of an economy's long-term competitiveness. The increase in education expenditure would improve the quality of the labor force, which was conducive to the cultivation of innovative talents. Innovation and education work together, Drive efficient productivity and research capabilities. The key feature of the world's leading economies was that they strived to match the total number of talents available in their own countries with the demand for talents in their own countries. The matching degree between China's talent competitiveness and its huge economy still need to be improved. The lack of competitiveness stems from its lack of attraction for International highly skilled talents and the lower average public expenditure on education than that of developed economic.

## **Research Objectives**

1. To make up for the deficiencies of the existing research on the performance evaluation mechanism of local urban talent policy, and provide new ideas for the research on the scientific performance evaluation system of talent policy.
2. To provide improvement basis for local governments in China to formulate high-level talent policies more effectively.
3. To provide optimization suggestions for high-level talents of local government governance in China, and promote the sustainable growth of local government economy and science and technology.

## Literature Reviews

In China's political and economic situation, the connotation of talent was mutually confirmed and formed by the definition of the academic circles from the perspective of management and the "political" definition of talent standards in the national talent policy documents. The academic community had continuously expanded the definition of talent. From the perspective of talent characteristics, contribution and performance were the largest common divisor of talent. From the perspective of national talent policy documents, the connotation of talent had roughly experienced five stages: **the first stage** was before the founding of China, and talent was about equal to "cadres"; **the second stage** was from the founding of the people's Republic of China to the reform and opening up. Talents were gradually separated from the connotation of cadres. Talents were called "intellectuals"; **the third stage**, from reform and opening up to 2003, talents referred to "people with technical secondary school education or above and professional and technical titles at or above the department level", emphasizing the education and technical ability of talents; **the fourth stage** was the decision of the CPC Central Committee and the State Council on further strengthening talent work in 2003, which stated that "as long as they had certain knowledge and skills, could carry out creative work, made positive contributions to promoting socialist material, political and spiritual civilization, and the great cause of building socialism with Chinese characteristics" they were all talents needed by the party and the state.

High level talents were those who held high-level positions and were engaged in important work in important departments and core positions. Some people in the academic circles had discussed the characteristics of high-level talents: professional characteristics, input characteristics, output characteristics, labor consumption characteristics, and individual reproduction characteristics of high-level talents (Yin Fengchun, 2004). High level talents were rare talents that could have a significant impact on the economy, politics and culture of the country, region or industry and form creative achievements (Zhang Qian, 2010). High level talents referred to those who had deep attainments and high prestige in a certain discipline or professional field, work in important positions, could undertake important tasks and played a greater role in economic and social development and scientific and technological innovation (Li Xingyun, 2010). In addition to the important characteristics of high-level talents such as strong ability and high quality, it further proposes that high-end talents had potential, that was, although some talent groups had made corresponding technical achievements

temporarily, they had great potential in some fields, and these talents should also be included in the research scope of high-level talent teams (Ni Haidong, Yang Xiaobo, 2014). At present, there was no unified definition of high-level talents in the academic circles. However, compared with ordinary talents, high-level talents were high-end leading talents with strong business ability, scientific research level and strategic vision in certain fields and industries (Zheng Dailiang, 2012).

## Research Methodology

The data collected through the questionnaire were analyzed by descriptive analysis. According to the details of the data distributed through the questionnaire, statistical methods were used for quantitative analysis. The relationship between variables was described by calculating the percentage, so as to more accurately indicate and confirm the evaluation results.

**Data Analyses: Analysis by Entropy Method,** Through the data analysis of literature collection, the entropy method was used to analyze the scores of various indicators calculated by the entropy value, analyze the weights of various indicators, and obtain the performance results of Guangzhou city high-level talent policy.

Firstly, determine the evaluation mode and selected the corresponding indicators. First of all, the talent policy of Guangzhou city was sorted out and analyzed to determine the factors involved in evaluating the performance of the talent introduction policy, selected the appropriate evaluation mode, and determined the first and second level indicators of the evaluation system. The indicators should cover all aspects of the evaluation policy performance, and at the same time, each indicator should maintain relative independence. The evaluation indicators should not only include the indicators that could be evaluated through the statistical yearbook, the government work report. The relevant documents of colleges and universities and the data collected by the third-party institutions should be evaluated for value, and the satisfaction evaluation after the implementation of the policy shall also be included.

Secondly, through the use of entropy method for objective weighting, the scores of various indicators calculated by entropy value were analyzed, the

weights of various indicators were analyzed, and the performance level of Guangzhou city high-level talent policy was calculated.

## Results

The so-called entropy method was to objectively and fairly reflect the real situation of the indicators. With the help of the ranking method, the entropy of specific indicators was integrated as an important reference and reference factor. On this basis, the effectiveness of a certain indicator was measured, and the value of the corresponding indicators was judged. In addition, the role of entropy method was not limited to this, it also had a certain role in the analysis of the dispersion of various indicators. Specifically, entropy and the dispersion between indicators generally showed an inverse proportional development relationship. The greater the change degree of the index, the smaller the entropy and the greater the dispersion, the more information the index could provide, and the greater the index weight. On the contrary, the smaller the change degree of an index, the greater the entropy, and the smaller the amount of information and index weight provided by the index.

The data collected through the questionnaire were analyzed by descriptive analysis. According to the details of the data distributed through the questionnaire, statistical methods were used for quantitative analysis. The relationship between variables was described by calculating the percentage, so as to more accurately indicate and confirm the evaluation results.

## Discussions

Policy Evaluation of High-Level Talents in Guangzhou city, Guangdong Province, People's Republic of China. The main innovations of the research were as follows:

1) A systematic evaluation framework of factual evaluation and subjective evaluation was established. The study abandoned the single path of objective performance measurement or subjective investigation in the previous talent policy evaluation, insisted that “fact evaluation was the foundation of public policy evaluation, and policy object experience evaluation was the origin of policy reflection”, and proposed that policy satisfaction evaluation was the

applicable evaluation dimension of talent policy experience evaluation, forming a multi-level talent policy performance evaluation system.

2) Analyze the high-level talent policy of Guangzhou city by combining point and area. Analyze whether Guangzhou city's high-level talent policy met the needs of talents and whether it played a role in stimulating talents. This paper compared Guangzhou city's high-level talent policies with those of developed countries in the world, and analyzes the shortcomings of Guangzhou city's high-level talent policies. Through the combination of point and area, we would comprehensively examine the high-level talent policy of Guangzhou city, and provide suggestions for further improving the high-level talent policy.

3) From the perspective of behavioral public management, this paper investigates the policy satisfaction of policy objects. In previous studies, the evaluation of policy objective achievement dimension and the evaluation of policy experience dimension were ignored. This study introduced the theory of expectation inconsistency in management psychology to try a combination of the perspective of Applied Behavioral public management in the field of high-level talent policy. The mediating effect of expectation inconsistency and the relevant conclusions of the impact of red tape on policy satisfaction, as well as the policy publicity in the process of high-level talent policy formulation and implementation policy process and other practical improvements provided a useful reference.

## Conclusions

### **The Framework Construction of High-Level Talent Policy Performance Evaluation System**

The research followed the steps of “policy origin-policy performance view-determination of index system”. Based on the previous research results of talent policy performance framework, standards, methods and talent performance view, the “original derivative” performance index analysis framework was proposed, with the indicators reflecting the development of talent team as the original indicators and the ability of talents to promote social innovation and development as the derived indicators, built a high-level talent policy performance indicator system. Entropy method was used to measure the effectiveness and value of multiple source material indicators based on

quantitative data, so as to jointly support the evaluation conclusion. Through the entropy method to calculate the weight of each index, the analysis shows that: on the one hand, the overall implementation effect of Guangzhou city high-level talent policy was good, the high-level talent policy had a significant positive effect on the development of Guangzhou city high-level talents, and the future development of Guangzhou city high-level talent policy was expected. On the other hand, to some extent, the improvement of the quality of high-level talents had not been paid enough attention, the improvement effect of high-level talents' independent innovation ability was not obvious, and the improvement of high-level talents' innovation ability and innovation output lacked the corresponding evaluation and incentive mechanism.

### **Analysis and Demonstration of the Evaluation Results of High-Level Talent Policies**

On the basis of systematically combing the basic situation of Guangzhou city and the development process of high-level talent policy in Guangzhou city, this paper analyzes the text of high-level talent policy. The research introduced the perspective of behavioral public management, followed the bottom-up path and behavioral framework of "policy object policy experience policy performance", and pay attention to the subjective performance centered on policy satisfaction. Based on this framework, through questionnaires and interviews with employers and introduced talents, we could understand the current situation of the formulation, content and implementation effect of Guangzhou city's high-level talent policy. The analysis results showed that: first, Guangzhou city's high-level talent policy covers a wide range of areas, the focus was not prominent, and the utility of "human capital" was not maximized. Second, the continuity of high-level talent policy was not enough and lacked long-term influence. Third, the structure of high-level talent policy types was unreasonable, there was no talent policy of laws and regulations, and there were few policies for introducing technological and practical talents. Third, policy implementation agencies were cumbersome and lacked coordination and efficiency. Although red tape was not a critical factor, it negatively affected policy satisfaction. Fourth, the carrier of high-level talents was insufficient. Talent introduction is mainly concentrated in colleges and universities and scientific research institutions. Private enterprises had more advantages than

other types of enterprises, but private enterprises were indeed difficult to promote the effect of high-level talent accumulation.

### **Analysis and Enlightenment of High-Level Talent Policies in the United States, Britain, South Korea and other Developed Countries**

Taking the United States, Britain and South Korea as examples, this paper analyzed their talent development strategies, talent training systems, talent introduction policies, talent laws and regulations, and finds that although the talent policies of various countries were different due to the differences in historical development process, cultural characteristics, economic foundation and political system, by combing their successful experience and practices in talent policies, to sum up their talent strategic development with their own characteristics, the measures and enlightenment that could be used for reference were as follows: first, improve the height of talent development strategy, and adhere to the principle of the Party Managing Talents Based on China's national conditions. Second, improved the talent training policy system, updated the talent training concept form, a talent training mechanism with the full participation of the government, society and families, and built a vocational training policy system dominated by the market, guided by the government, supported by society and participated by enterprises. Third, we should strengthen the policy of introducing high-level talents and improved the immigration system. Fourth, optimized the environment for talent development and improved the legal and policy environment.

## References

Alexandru Volacu. (2018). **Australian Journal of Public Administration.** Justice, Efficiency, and the New Public Management, P.404-414.

Ahn.S.H., Choi,Y.J., & Kim,Y.M.(2012). **Social Indicators Research.** Static Numbers to Dynamic Statistics:Designing a Policy-Friendly Social Policy Indicator Framework,p.387-400.

BEKİR TAVAS. (2019). **Bitlis Eren Üniversitesi İktisadi Ve İdari Bilimler Fakültesi Akademik İzdüşüm.** Principles and Application of New Public Management Approach, P.283-294.

Bardach, E., & Patashnik, E.M. (2019). **A Practical Guide for Policy Analysis: The Eightfold Path to More Effective Problem Solving.** CQ Press.

Cao Xia, Wang Yangyang, Cheng Yifei. (2010). **Technology and Economy.** The Index System for Evaluating the Effect of Policies and Mechanisms for the Construction of High-Level Creative Talents, p.71-74.

Fan Bainai, Cheng Hongwei, Zhang Li. (2006). **Journal of Public Management.** Korean Government Performance Evaluation and Its Reference to China, p.21-26-108.

Fan Ziying. (2018). **Finance and Economics Think Tank.** How to Scientifically Evaluate the Effects of Economic Policy, P.42-64-142-143.

Gao Ting. (2018). **Jiangsu Science and Technology Information.** Research on the Development and Characteristics of Talent Policies at Home and Abroad, p.24-26-44.

Hu Shuigen, Wang Jing, park Zhongquan. (2006). **Performance Evaluation and Evaluation of Korean Government.** Journal of Gansu Institute of Administration, p.12-15.

Jonkers, K., & Tijssen, R. (2008). **Scientometrics.** Chinese Researchers Returning Home: Impacts of International Mobility on Research Collaboration and Scientific Productivity, p.309-333.

Ning Sao. (2000). **Beijing:Higher Education Press.** Public Policy.

Ni Xing, Fu Jingtao. (2014). **Dongbei University of Finance and Economics Press.** Public Management.

Stuart.S, Nagel. (1994). **Changchun:Jilin People's Publishing House.** Policy Research: Integration and Evaluation.

Tummers. L., Weske, U., Bouwman, R., & Grimmelikhuijsen, S. (2016). **The Impact of Red Tape on Citizen Satisfaction.** International Public Management Journal, An Experimental Study, p.320-341.

Van Ryzin, G. G. (2013). **An Experimental Test of the Expectancy-Confirmation Theory of Citizen Satisfaction.** Journal of Policy Analysis and Management, p. 597-614.

Wang Pujiao, Lai Xianjin. (2013). **Mode and Mechanism Analysis of Public Policy Diffusion in China.** Journal of Peking University (Philosophy and Social Sciences Edition), p.14-23.

Xiao Zhengbin, Zhu Shanding, Zhang Xiaojing. (2011). **Research on Science and Technology Management.** Research on Performance Evaluation of Innovative Science and Technology Talents in Hunan Province, p.48-51.

Zou Linquan. (2010). **Management Informatization in China.** Design of Performance Evaluation Index System for Science and Technology Innovation Policy, p.20-25.